

Medicaid Health Plan NCQA Quality Rankings – Factoring in Enrollment Levels and Local Competition

Five Slide Series, Volume 8
January 2014

The Menges Group

www.themengesgroup.com

703-942-8104

Summary of Our Methodology

- We worked with NCQA's published ranking of 131 Medicaid MCOs, loading this information into a MicroSoft Excel spreadsheet
 - These 2013 rankings & quality scores are available at: <http://healthplanrankings.ncqa.org>
- Each plan's July 2011 Medicaid enrollment level was added to the file
 - Enrollment data source: <http://www.medicaid.gov/Medicaid-CHIP-Program-Information/By-Topics/Data-and-Systems/Downloads/2011-Medicaid-MC-Enrollment-Report.pdf>
 - The 2011 enrollment data matches up well with the measurement year used for many components of NCQA's quality scores for the 2013 reporting year
 - This file allowed us to calculate all average quality scores on an enrollment weighted basis
- Medicaid MCO quality performance was assessed in two ways:
 1. **Across states**, we calculated average quality scores and compared states with one another. NCQA's ranked Medicaid plans during 2013 operated in 33 states.
 2. **Within states**, we calculated how each plan's 2013 NCQA score compared with the "rest-of-state" average score. We then ranked the 131 plans nationally based on how well their quality score compared to the average of their NCQA-ranked same-state competitors

Average NCQA Medicaid Quality Scores by State, 2013

State Rank	State	Number of NCQA Ranked Medicaid MCOs	NCQA Ranked Medicaid MCOs' Collective Enrollment, July 2011	2013 Enrollment-Weighted Quality Score
1	Massachusetts	5	492,584	86.14
2	Rhode Island	2	135,049	85.53
3	Minnesota	2	292,207	83.51
4	New York	6	731,195	82.08
5	Texas	2	385,462	82.05
6	Hawaii	3	170,313	81.42
7	Pennsylvania	8	1,087,281	81.20
8	Delaware	2	154,904	81.18
9	New Jersey	2	517,791	81.17
10	District of Columbia	1	52,980	80.90
11	Tennessee	7	1,218,676	80.81
12	Maryland	6	590,933	80.79
13	Utah	1	50,636	80.70
14	Georgia	3	951,408	80.69
15	Virginia	6	539,547	80.17
16	Michigan	12	1,168,564	79.92
17	Indiana	4	725,469	79.46

State Rank	State	Number of NCQA Ranked Medicaid MCOs	NCQA Ranked Medicaid MCOs' Collective Enrollment, July 2011	2013 Enrollment-Weighted Quality Score
18	South Carolina	3	373,022	79.38
19	New Mexico	6	401,318	78.82
20	Missouri	2	233,959	78.48
21	Kentucky	4	231,142	77.81
22	Ohio	7	1,605,042	77.01
23	Nevada	1	78,523	76.70
24	Florida	11	1,015,285	75.46
25	West Virginia	3	166,555	73.77
26	California	10	2,692,573	73.67
27	Washington	2	261,871	73.61
28	Oregon	1	153,684	73.40
29	Nebraska	2	100,972	73.31
30	Wisconsin	3	138,600	73.00
31	Mississippi	1	21,028	68.60
32	Colorado	2	67,481	68.53
33	Illinois	1	134,476	57.40
	USA Total	131	16,940,530	78.44

Figures include only those Medicaid MCOs ranked by NCQA. Each statewide score represents the enrollment-weighted average across each MCO's 2013 quality score, based on CMS published enrollment information as of July 2011.

State Quality Comparisons -- Summary Findings

- Nationwide, the average NCQA score was 78.4
 - This is the enrollment-weighted average across all 131 Medicaid health plans.
- Massachusetts has the nation's highest average quality score (86.1)
- Seven of the ten states with the highest average quality scores are located in the Northeastern and Mid-Atlantic regions of the country.
- There may be inherent advantages to operating in certain geographic regions (in terms of an MCO's ability to achieve high quality scores).
 - The same level of MCO investment directed at HEDIS scores will likely yield different scores in different geographic areas.
 - Some of the nation's highest-performing Medicaid MCOs may therefore be those that have achieved particularly high scores within their state.
 - These dynamics led us to conduct the comparisons shown on the next slide.

Top 15 Medicaid Plans, Based on 2013 NCQA Quality Score Relative to Other MCOs in Their State

National Rank, Plan Difference In NCQA Quality Score From Its Rest-of-State Average, 2013	Plan Name	State	Plan's NCQA Score, 2013	Percentage Points Plan's NCQA Score is Above (Below) Rest-of-State Average	NCQA National Rank, 2013	NCQA Rank Within State, 2013	Number of NCQA Ranked Plans in State, 2013
1	Passport Health Plan	KY	83.3	21.2	21	1	4
2	Security Health Plan of Wisconsin	WI	84.0	18.7	12	1	3
3	United Healthcare Community Plan	NE	80.5	14.8	52	1	2
4	UNICARE Health Plan of West Virginia	WV	78.8	9.9	76	2	3
5	Kaiser Foundation Health Plan - Hawaii	HI	88.6	8.5	2	1	3
6	Health Plan of the Upper Ohio Valley	WV	80.9	8.5	44	1	3
7	Priority Health	MI	85.7	6.1	4	1	12
8	Molina Healthcare of Washington	WA	79.6	6.1	69	1	2
9	HealthCare USA of Missouri	MO	79.7	5.8	64	1	2
10	Humana Medical Plan - Florida	FL	81.0	5.8	43	1	11
11	WellCare of Florida	FL	79.8	5.3	60	2	11
12	United Healthcare Community Plan	MI	83.8	4.9	16	5	12
13	CareSource	OH	79.2	4.6	70	2	7
14	Blue Cross Complete of Michigan	MI	84.3	4.5	10	2	12
15	Midwest Health Plan	MI	84.0	4.4	14	4	12

Medicaid MCO Performance Comparisons -- Summary Findings

- Our rankings on prior slide seek to adjust for regional norms and to identify the MCOs that are performing furthest above their in-state competitors
- Only 4 of NCQA's 15 highest-ranked Medicaid plans also appear on our Top 15 list
 - Our list could rank some plans very high primarily because the other MCOs in their state have not yet performed well in the quality arena.
- Passport Health Plan has the widest favorable quality gap in 2013
 - Passport's longstanding presence in the Louisville area, coupled with the other Kentucky plans being relatively new to the state and serving markets (in 2011) that were less accustomed to coordinated care, likely contributed to this statistical result -- along with Passport's own quality enhancement investments and efforts.
- The rapid growth of published and independently verified MCO quality performance data is an important, exciting development in the Medicaid coordinated care arena -- and in the broader health system.